



**ACADEMIC SENATE**

**Meeting Minutes**

January 25, 2022

Zoom Meeting ID: 442 779  
680

1700 W. Hillsdale Blvd.  
San Mateo, CA  
2:30 – 4:30 pm  
[Website](#)

**Executive Committee 2018-2022**

Teresa Morris/Arielle Smith  
President co-chairs

Jesenia Diaz  
Vice-President

Stephen Heath  
Treasurer

Daniel Keller  
Secretary

**Executives Present**

<b>Name of Officer</b>	<b>Executive Committee Role</b>
Jesenia Diaz	Vice-president
Stephen Heath	Treasurer
Daniel Keller	Secretary
Arielle Smith	President

**Senators Present**

<b>Name of Senator</b>	<b>Division</b>
Ron Andrade	Counselling
Michelle Beatty	Math Science
Michelle Brown	CASS
Yvette Butterworth	Math Science
Jennifer Howze-Owens	ASLT
Vincent Li	Business
Trang Luong	Counselling
Sunny Martin	Counselling
Andrea Morales	ASCSM
Gil Perez	Counseling
Kevin Sinarle	Counselling
Lia Thomas (she/her)	Library
Christopher Walker	Curriculum
Katherine Webster	Language Arts
Todd Windisch	Language Arts
Lale Yurtseven	Business Technology

**Others Present**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Representing</b>
Briana Avila	Language Arts
Mike Holtzclaw	CSM Vice President Instruction
Madeleine Murphy	CTL, SLOAC
Liz Schuler	CTL, PD

**Opening Procedures**

Item	Presenter	Time	Details	Action/ Information/ Procedure
Approval of today's agenda	President	2:34	<p>We made a change to the hiring committees item: Canada has two of our faculty members who are participating on hiring committees at their campus, so we have added those names. Move to approve: Todd. Second: Daniel All approve</p> <p><b>Consent agenda:</b> Resolution: Brown Act, Ongoing proclaimed state of emergency relating to the novel coronavirus causing the disease known as COVID-19.</p> <p>Move to approve: Todd. Second: Daniel All approve</p>	Procedure
Approval of past minutes	President	2:35	Approved with changes to attendance	Procedure
Public Comment	Public	2:36	No public comment	Information

### New Senate Business

	Item	Presenter	Time	Details	Action (Motion/Resolution)/ Information//Discussion
1	President's Report	Arielle	2:50	<p>Many committees have not yet met. We will be discussing the IPC enrollment update later in the meeting.</p> <p>The Great Read is still happening. We will have until the next meeting to upload the whole group's summary of what you have read. If anyone is having any trouble finding specific documents, please reach out to Teresa, Arielle, or Jesenia.</p> <p>Groups should meet first; the feedback should just be a record of the group's discussion rather than a note from each member of the group.</p>	Information
2	ASCSM Update	ASCSM , Andrea	2:50	ASCSM just met for the first time yesterday. We are having a welcome event tomorrow from 10:30-1:00 featuring a panel with administrators and staff. The event will take place in building 10 near the cafeteria.	Information
3	Standing Committee Reports	Christopher	2:50	<p>a) Curriculum Committee, Christopher Walker, Chair</p> <p>Our first meeting, an overflow session for the courses we did not complete last term, is Thursday. We are just about finished with the</p>	Information

		Madeleine		<p>district curriculum committee and getting the AP exams for credit aligned across the district.</p> <p>b) Committee Teaching and Learning, Liz Schuler/Madeleine Murphy</p> <p>Madeleine: We met yesterday, focusing mostly on professional development. In our next meeting, we will look at the SLO plan draft. So for the next meeting, I will have some feedback</p>	
		Liz		<p>Liz: CTL did a flex day follow-up and debrief. We hope to get an email out later this week. We are also focusing on the PD plan and hope to get a more robust draft to Senate and IPC. Also we discussed issues around flex classrooms and attendance—ways that people are meeting student needs when some are absent.</p>	
		Jennifer		<p>c) Distance Education Advisory Committee; Jennifer Howze-Owens</p> <p>We have not met yet; however, in preparation for the three-year mark of QOTL, we are planning new offerings of QOTL 1 and 2 for spring and summer for new instructors. The guidance is that everyone needs to refresh on their online teaching every three years, so we are starting to push folks to have their training earlier.</p>	
		Lia		<p>d) OER Update; Lia Thomas No updates currently.</p>	
5	Action Items		3:05	<p>1. Approval of hiring committees</p> <p>a. Business Faculty hiring committee Chris: are we not requiring people from outside the division to be on these? Arielle: I think that we probably should discuss that at a future meeting because we have gone back and forth on this issue. We have established that they can't all be from the same department, but there is less clarity about the division.</p> <p>Move to approve: Todd; Second: Kevin All approve</p>	<b>Action</b>

				<p>b. Disability Resource Center (DRC) – We sent this back last semester to request more diversity on the committee. The new committee includes people from outside the division.</p> <p>Move to approve: Lale; Second: Michelle Brown All approve</p> <p>c. Art History hiring committee</p> <p>Move to Approve: Kevin Second: Lale All approve</p> <p>d. Ethnic Studies hiring committee Kevin: Move to approve; Jesenia Second All approved</p> <p>e. Requests from Canada: Kinesiology, Athletics and Dance Dean/Athletic Director hiring committee (Canada)</p> <p>They have asked Bret Pollack to serve Move to approve: Jesenia; Second: Kevin. All Approve</p> <p>f. Digital Arts and Animation faculty hiring committee (Canada) Lale: Move to approve; Michelle Brown: Second. All approve</p> <p>g. Peer evaluation committees: Business Tech, Language Arts, Student Services Lale: Move to approve. Yvette: Second. All approve</p>	
6.	Discussion items		3:15	<p>1. Enrollment Update – conversation with Mike Holtzclaw – Vice President of Instruction</p> <p>Mike: As you all know, enrollment is down substantially. But I want to remind everyone that this is not just because of COVID: we have been on a downward trajectory for the last ten years. At our three colleges collectively, total enrollment is what CSM used to be back in the</p>	<b>Discussion</b>

2000s. But COVID has hurt community colleges in particular, so we are all struggling across the state.

We are fortunate in that the board agreed to lower the expectation of enrollments; the MOU that was negotiated for the spring semester lowers class enrollment minimums from 20 to 10.

Mike shared enrollment numbers: we are down 12% at CSM; Skyline is down 21%; Canada is down 11%. Skyline is now lower in enrollment than CSM. Because FTES is one of the drivers for the district allocation model, CSM will be getting more resources from the district. It affects our categorical spending, though not our state funding since we are a basic aid district.

On international students: CSM's international student population has been the highest in the district. International students must be full time, so when they drop it has a significant effect—this is why the count matters so much.

We had over 700 international students, but we are down to 197 now. Both Skyline and Canada have lost students as well, but the district has tried to even it out a little more so that both of these colleges get more students. But COVID and the Trump era have both negatively affected our international enrollment.

We usually want the load to be at 525—we are down to 348.

The bottom line is that the load number is based around pure lecture classes; programs like Nursing will not have the same “efficiency” since the load is based on 35 students in a class. It's really an approximation about how efficient we are—if the classes were always close to full, we would be closer to 525.

Part of why CSM has not lost as much enrollment as Skyline and Canada is that we have been trying to add courses where there is

demand, and there has been more demand for online classes. We also have healthy face-to-face classes, and some late start classes, so we are close to where we were last spring.

Lale: we do have a lot of late start classes, so I assume these numbers will change?

Mike: Yes. Later in the year I can give an update on this. We are continuing to gain students through the late start classes.

Jesenia: What other factors besides COVID have led to the decrease When did it begin?

Mike: The decline started in 2011—but it has become much worse. We are looking at ways to create enrollment management plans, investing more in marketing and outreach. But we also know that it is really expensive to live in the area, so a lot of families are leaving. Our feeder schools are projecting much smaller enrollments as well.

We can focus more on athletes and international students—these are the only programs we are allowed to recruit students outside of the district.

Stephen: Are we losing students because they are not choosing to go at all, or that they are going to a 4 year? It sounds like they are just choosing to go out of the area?

Mike: It's a little of all of those things. We know that some students have just withdrawn due to the pandemic. Lower income students are also struggling because of the need to work to support family and extended family. Whether classes are in person or online, this pandemic has disproportionately affected BIPOC and low income students.

Mike stressed that we have lost a lot of Black/African American students and our Pacific Islander population has also dropped—this

reinforces that we need to do more work around these populations.

The other issue is that *all* colleges have now learned how to offer online classes: geography doesn't matter anymore, or it matters less—other colleges are offering online classes, so we are competing with them. So we need to think about whether we are offering what they need and in the way that they need it—they can otherwise take courses online.

Enrollment overlap is another factor: There are more students enrolled in colleges other than CSM—in our sister colleges. Before COVID, 16% were taking classes at multiple locations within the district. Since we have offered more online, students are even more likely to take classes at the other colleges. We need to be sure that we are working with our sister colleges and not just seeing them as competition.

Finally modality: online asynchronous has become the most popular choice; then face to face, then online hybrid and synchronous. This does not align well with our offerings at the start of the term—we started with 65% face to face or hybrid, but students are voting with their feet for the asynchronous classes.

Michelle Brown: Do we have enrollment numbers for disabled students? Mike: I have not seen those numbers, but it is something we should be looking at. I can ask PRIE. There have been some positive outcomes related to this—we never thought to put adapted PE online, but it did seem to work for many students either because of mobility or transportation issues.

Kevin: I would love to see the numbers, but anecdotally—some students are gravitating online and some who were reluctant have decided they love it. But many are struggling online. Faculty have been very good about being flexible and meeting student needs.

			4:00	<p style="text-align: center;">2. Faculty discussion on Spring semester</p> <p>We discussed a number of concerns about the spring term as students and faculty return to face-to-face classes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. It would help to have clearer guidance from administration about when a face-to-face class should go online. Kat: If 10% of a class tests positive, is that when we switch modes? Lale also noted that HyFlex classes have sometimes had very few students choosing to attend, but faculty have been told they must hold in-person sessions regardless: when do we make those classes simply online?</li> <li>b. Some faculty also feel that they don't have clear guidelines about how to help students who are missing a lot of face-to-face classes due to illness: we can't be expected to teach hybrid courses for some students while teaching in-person for the rest. Creating back-up modules is an enormous burden on top of regular teaching.</li> <li>c. Students generally seem to be complying with mask rules, but faculty are not sure what to do for those who are not. Particularly in the cafeteria and building 10 in general, many students are unmasked indoors. Other faculty have noticed some classes being held with low mask compliance. Also, while CSM has a 90-95% vaccination rate, since the campus is open to the general public, we cannot be sure that all visitors are vaccinated.</li> <li>d. Staffing of the library and learning centers is another concern: if staff are sick, some of the centers cannot stay open. Lia noted that three librarians were out sick in one week.</li> <li>e. We remain concerned about the availability of tests. Briana Avila shared that she had filed two in-class exposure</li> </ul>	
--	--	--	------	--	--



				<p>reports, but it doesn't seem like testing is available for faculty or students. Even reporting has been challenging—it has been a ton of follow-up to ensure that things are reported to the right place. More follow-up after these reports would also be helpful.</p> <p>f. Some of the messaging is a little confusing: for English language learners, it may be particularly challenging. Todd said that it would be impossible to provide translations for all students—there are nearly 70 languages spoken at CSM—so simplicity of messaging is extremely important.</p> <p>Arielle: I will work on organizing the comments and sending them up. If there are things that people would like for me to communicate up, I am able to do that—and I won't use names. Please let me know.</p> <p>Meeting adjourned at 4:29</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--